

**Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting  
Civic Center Plaza, Suite 1940  
March 4, 2016**

**I. OPENING BUSINESS**

Chairman Monte Moses called the meeting to order at 1:00 pm.

**A. Attendance**

Chairman Moses, Commissioners John Anderson, Maia Babbs, Renny Fagan, Dick Kaufman, Vanecia Kerr, and Tom McGimpsey attended the meeting. Commissioners Paula Sandoval and BJ Scott attended via conference call. Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Senator Nancy Todd, Wayne Artis, Tyrel Jacobsen, Steve Kreidler, Gretchen Morgan, Barbara Morris and Melissa Wagner.

**B. Minutes**

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the minutes of the February 5, 2016 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and passed unanimously.

**C. Chair, Vice Chair, Commissioners and Advisor Reports**

- Chairman Moses asked that a letter, reinforcing the Commission's stance of support that the Hospital Provider Fee have enterprise status, be sent to the General Assembly.
- **Student Success & Academic Affairs Subcommittee** - Commissioner Anderson, Chairman of the Student Success & Academic Affairs Subcommittee, reported the following topics were discussed at the meeting on March 4, 2016: Prior Learning Assessment; Concurrent Enrollment; a Charter for the committee; student activities that affect the Master Plan; the COF Initiative; the lack of teachers in Colorado's rural communities; and, how to bridge the gap between secondary and post-secondary students.
- Advisor Artis reported that the Faculty Advisory Council meeting was held on February 14<sup>th</sup>. He thanked Dr. Ian MacGillivray and the Department staff for the open collaboration on the Prior Learning Assessment. In addition, he shared that the Council passed a resolution

supporting the Commission's resolution on the Hospital Provider Fee and asked the Commission include the Faculty Advisory Council's support in subsequent communication on the matter.

- Advisor Jacobsen reported, as a representative for the Colorado Student Government Coalition, that the University of Colorado-Boulder recommends Meningitis B vaccines on college campuses. The Coalition also advocates for the Hospital Provider Fee issue.
- Advisor Kreidler reported on three headlines in Higher Education National Newsletter: the Pennsylvania budget stand-off puts 1,100 higher education jobs at risk, bipartisan ship has created a stalemate and is holding higher education hostage; Louisiana has permanently cut two-thirds of their higher education budget and there is now a \$70 million mid-year cut; and, Illinois Chicago State University has given notice to all 900 of their employees will be laid off in two months unless there is a budget deal.

#### **D. Executive Director Report**

Chief Operating Officer Jennifer Sobanet gave the Executive Director's Report in Lt. Governor Joe Garcia's stead. Ms. Sobanet reported the following to the Commission:

- Introduced Dr. Russ Meyer, as the Interim Student Success and Academic Affairs Officer, stepping in after Dr. Rhonda Epper took a position as Provost with the Community College of Denver. The Department is in the process of hiring a permanent replacement for Dr. Epper and hope to be able to introduce the new Chief Student Success and Academic Officer Affairs at the next CCHE meeting.
- Follow up to February 5<sup>th</sup> CCHE meeting presentation by Mr. Brandon Busted: USA Funds and Gallup Purdue Index will be working with the Department to bring high national level information to the Colorado and the state's higher education institutions.
- Also at the February 5<sup>th</sup> meeting, staff suggested language for an amendment that the Commission approved for the Prior Learning Assessment action item but Commissioner Colón invited staff to review that language. The amendment that was approved read, "Institutions may advise students with PLA credits that the student may be more successful in subsequent coursework if they take the college course but the institution may not require the student take the college course." Staff concluded that language is adequate and the Commission will see it in the agenda item to approve the AP and IB PLA recommendations in the formal Commission policy template, which is an action item for today.

#### **E. Public Comment**

Mr. Adam Sanchez, from the University of Colorado-Denver (UCD) is the Vice President of Students for Intellectual Property, shared with the Commission efforts being undertaken around intellectual property rights and royalty shares for students. He asserted that the University of Colorado is making claims to a portion of an invention because of significant use of their resources. In addition, he claimed that

some institutions claim 100% ownership. Mr. Sanchez asked that this subject be a discussion at the next CCHE meeting.

Chairman Moses said the Commission would take Mr. Sanchez' request under advisement. The Chairman also told him that the actual oversight of issues of this type fall to the legislature or are at an institutional level and are not under the statutory authority of the Commission.

Mr. John Bennet, Associate Vice Chancellor for Innovation Initiatives at the University of Colorado – Anschutz campus told the Commission that he is responsible is directing InWorks, a collaborative innovation group, that provides facilities for students to develop ideas and inventions with no claim on intellectual property. Mr. Bennet asserted that CU makes no claim on Mr. Sanchez on the group's inventions.

## **II. Consent Items**

- A. **Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Arts in Entrepreneurship at Metropolitan State University of Denver** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray
- B. **Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Arts in Global Business Studies at Metropolitan State University of Denver** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray
- C. **Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Science in International Business at Metropolitan State University of Denver** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray
- D. **Recommend Retroactive Approval of Bachelor of Fine Arts in Animation, Film and Motion Design at Colorado Mesa University** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray
- E. **Recommend Approval of Bachelor of Arts in Early Childhood Education at Adams State University** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray & Dr. Robert Mitchell
- F. **Recommend Approval of Education Doctorate in Leadership at Adams State University** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray & Dr. Robert Mitchell
- G. **Recommend Approval of Master of Arts in Applied Sport Psychology at Adams State University** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray
- H. **Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Program List – Colorado State University – Ft. Collins** – Cat Olukotun
- I. **Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Program List – Ft. Lewis College** – Cat Olukotun
- J. **Degree Authorization Act – Recommend Approval for the Renewal of Authorization** – Heather DeLange

Commissioner McGimpsey moved to approve consent items A through J. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Babbs and unanimously passed.

## **III. Discussion Items**

- A. **Fiscal Year 2016-17 Need-Based Financial Aid Allocation Model** – Andrew Rauch, Lead Financial Analyst, presented the allocation model for State's need-based student financial aid grant program. The general principles of the model include: supporting timely completion and progress through college; targeting aid to students with the most need; treating Pell eligible students similarly across institutions; and, ensuring predictability for financial aid administrators from year to year. As a decentralized financial aid state, the allocations to the institutions are

the primary tool the Commission has to drive its policy agenda toward completions and Master Plan goals - working to incent completion by increasing the dollar amount awarded to students as they progress through grade levels.

The increment between all the grades is the same (\$314); the allocation for a senior level FTE is three increments higher, or \$942 more than the allocation for a freshman FTE. The three proposed models align with the Completion Incentives Model approach by incentivizing completions; targeting aid toward the most needy students; and, treating Pell-eligible students the same across institutions of higher education.

Model One serves to show how the allocation would work based on raw data. Models Two and Three work to encapsulate the idea of predictability for institutions by having guardrail provisions built into the models. These provisions keep institutions from gaining more, or losing less, than 5% in Model Two and 10% in Model Three. These models were shared with the Financial Aid Advisory Council with Model Two gaining the most support for its predictability, while still meeting the other goals of the model. The increment between the grade levels is the same in all of these models, but the allocation amount is slightly different to balance out the model.

**B. Tuition Policy** - Todd Haggerty, Lead Finance Analyst, provided information on recommended policy revisions to Commission Policy Section VI, Part C “Tuition and Fees.”

The recommended changes to Commission policies to clearly outline the Commission’s role and processes and procedures for establishing the tuition increase limit and governing board request for additional flexibility were given. Mr. Haggerty explained that following the February 5<sup>th</sup> Commission meeting, staff met with the Chief Financial Officers and the Fiscal Affairs and Audit Committee to discuss additional changes to the tuition policy. Mr. Haggerty noted that key changes from the draft presented at the February Commission meeting are as follows:

- Expresses the tuition policy limit (full flexibility) for FY 2016-17 that the Commission adopted on October 29, 2015, and limit (if applicable) in a separate memorandum to the governing boards rather than annually amending Commission policy.
- Adds language to indicate that tuition limits or restrictions imposed by the General Assembly will supersede any tuition increase limit adopted by the Commission.

Mr. Haggerty reiterated that the tuition policy process is running parallel with legislative process and there should be clarity on the direction of the General Assembly following the March 9<sup>th</sup> figure setting for higher education. He added, regardless of General Assembly’s action, he doesn’t expect significant changes to policy except for Section 6 of the policy - which relates to tuition revenue spending authority and the Commission’s ability to utilize a contingency fund—as had been practice prior to fiscal year 2012.

Chairman Moses asked about the General Assembly's opinion on the Commission policy. Mr. Haggerty responded there will be a better understanding of the General Assembly's view on the policy following figure setting on March 9 and the economic and revenue forecast on March 18<sup>th</sup>.

Commissioner Fagan asked about the difference between tuition policy and a tuition limit. In response, Mr. Haggerty stated that in Colorado, and across the states, tuition policy has historically meant a limitation on the tuition increases. He added that this is why staff recommended amending the CCHE policy to reflect a process to determine a tuition limit rather than amending the policy each year.

Ms. Sobanet added that the process will become much clearer in the coming fiscal year when the Commission will be able to see the development of the budget request in tandem with the tuition increase limit for fiscal year 2017-18.

Senator Todd requested that staff continue their efforts to inform all legislators on the connection between the State's level of investment and tuition increases.

Mr. Haggerty concluded his comments by reiterating that the revisions are based on the CCHE and Governor's tuition policy proposal that is being considered by the 2016 General Assembly and that the proposed CCHE policy revisions assumes the General Assembly will concur with the proposal. If the General Assembly does not concur with the proposal and takes a different approach, the tuition policy may need to be adjusted accordingly. The Commission can expect to have the tuition policy, depending on legislative action, as either a discussion item or action item for the April meeting.

- C. Legislative Update** – Kachina Weaver. Legislative Liaison, provided Commissioners and Advisors with a list of bills be tracked by the Department, all of which the Department is neutral on at this point. Ms. Weaver provided more detail around the discussions with the JBC and institutions around the formula and tuition policy, as well as next steps in the process. Advisor Artis asked for clarification around the intent of HB 16-1144, regarding transparency of college courses for high school students. Ms. Weaver explained that this bill would require local districts to inform high school students about post-secondary courses they are considering that do not meet the concurrent enrollment requirements and may not be transferrable.
  
- D. Degree Authorization Act – Update on the Closure of Westwood College** - Heather DeLange, Academic Policy Officer, provided an update on the closure of Westwood College. She highlighted the teach-out agreement that Westwood College entered into with National American University (NAU). Norm Blome, Chief Compliance Officer at Westwood College, provided the details regarding the closure. Dr. Ron Shape, CEO of NAU and Michael Trump, Associate General Counsel for NAU, also provided comments as to the details from the NAU side regarding the agreement.
  
- E. Hospital Provider Fee Update** – Kachina Weaver provided a status update on the efforts to change the Hospital Provider Fee to an enterprise. She explained

that a recent AG opinion was issued confirming that this action would be constitutional and within the authority of the Legislature to act upon. Ms. Weaver had drafted a letter for the Commission that would reiterate the Commission's support for the change, reminding legislative leaders about the resolution that the Commission passed in August 2015 to this effect, as well as the pointing out the support of institutions and other non-higher education groups. Chairman Moses asked that the message of the letter be strengthened to include an "ask" that the issue at least be allowed to come for a vote.

#### **IV. Action Items**

**A. Recommend Approval of Commission Policy I, X: Prior Learning Assessment** – Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Director of Academic Affairs, presented this item for action. A related question was asked about next steps in the PLA process. Dr. Macgillivray explained that, because there is not as much clear cut data on CLEP and DSST exams and student success, the Constituent Review Team that meets on Monday, March 7, 2016 will likely recommend to the Commission that the deadline for cut scores on CLEP and DSST exams be extended to late 2016 to allow faculty and the Department to study them.

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve Commission Policy I, X. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and unanimously passed.

#### **V. DHE Presentations to Commission**

**A. 2016 Legislative Report on the Postsecondary Progress and Success of High School Graduates** – Luke Banaszak, Data Management and Research Analyst, presented to the Commission a PowerPoint Presentation overviewing the 2016 Postsecondary Success and Outcomes Report. The Report analyzes the postsecondary outcomes of Colorado high school graduates from 2009 through 2014, and the presentation highlighted significant findings from this report.

Commissioner Kerr asked that the calculation of enrollment rates and remediation rates be clarified, and that the difference between retention rates and relatively low attainment rates be addressed. Mr. Banaszak, regarding the former, explained that enrollment rates are calculated as a proportion of the entire graduating class, while the remedial rate is limited to students who enrolled at a postsecondary institution. Regarding the latter, Mr. Banaszak noted that the issue of third and fourth year retention is being increasingly analyzed. Advisor Kreidler emphasized the significance of third and fourth year retention, and explained that the issue is deeply analyzed at Metropolitan State University.

Chairman Moses asked that the minor increase in the proportion of graduates enrolling at out-of-state colleges be addressed. Mr. Banaszak explained that empirical information on the issue was not immediately available, and then noted that previously declining in-state enrollment is better explained by the increase in non-enrollments than out-of-state enrollments.

**B. Online Admission Standards Tool Presentation** - Carl Einhaus, Director of Student Success and Dawn Taylor Owens, Executive Director of College In

Colorado, presented this item. Dawn Taylor Owens provided a brief introduction regarding the purpose the admission tool to: more clearly communicate admission standards to Colorado institutions; accommodate the changes of the new admission policy which begins in fall 2019; and, reflect the holistic admission approach many institutions are already practicing.

Carl Einhaus gave a demonstration of the online tool. The Commissioners provided positive feedback.

Commissioner Fagan asked if we could track how many students visit the site. Mr. Einhaus and Ms. Owen responded that College In Colorado already has begun to measure site visits and usage by page using Google Analytics. Discussion on how to market the tool were also addressed – Mr. Einhaus and CIC staff have been giving presentations at many meetings, conferences and similar throughout Colorado to promote and increase public awareness. Mr. Einhaus is also partnering with CDE to identify other opportunities to increase awareness.

***There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:25pm.***