

**Minutes of the Colorado Commission on Higher Education (CCHE) Meeting  
Pikes Peak Community College  
June 2, 2016**

**I. OPENING BUSINESS**

Chairman Monte Moses called the meeting to order at 12:40pm.

**A. Attendance**

Chairman Moses, Commissioners John Anderson, Maia Babbs, Renny Fagan, Jeanette Garcia, Dick Kaufman and BJ Scott attended the meeting. Vice Chair Colon and Commissioner Sandoval attended via conference call.

Also in attendance were CCHE Advisory Committee members Senator Chris Holbert, Wayne Artis, Mark Cavanaugh and Tyrel Jacobsen. Advisor Steve Kreidler attended via conference call.

**B. Minutes**

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the minutes of the May 6, 2016 CCHE meeting. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and passed unanimously.

**C. Welcome**

Dr. Homer Wesley, Vice President of Student Services at Pikes Peak Community College, welcomed the Commissioners to the campus.

**D. Chair, Vice Chair, Commissioners and Advisor Reports**

- Chairman Moses announced the meeting would be the last for both Commissioner Scott and Commissioner Kaufman, as their terms end on June 30, 2016. The Chairman presented the Commissioners with Colorado State Flags, read their proclamations and thanked them for their service.
- Student Success & Academic Affairs Standing Committee - Commissioner Anderson, Chair, updated the Commission on the committee's activities.
- Fiscal Affairs and Audit Standing Committee – Commissioner BJ Scott, Chair, updated the Commission on the committee's activities.

## **E. Acting Executive Director Report**

Jennifer Sobanet, Acting Executive Director, reported the following:

- Diane Duffy will be the new Chief Operating Officer at the Department, as of June 6<sup>th</sup>.
  - On behalf of the Department, Ms. Duffy attended the annual Western Interstate Commission on Higher Education (WICHE) meeting. This was the last meeting for outgoing President David Longanecker. He will be replaced by former Lt. Governor Joe Garcia.
- The Gallup Index/USA Funds breakfast will be held on June 9<sup>th</sup> in Denver.
- Also on June 9<sup>th</sup> will be the “Launch My Career Colorado” event
- Complete College America Convening will be Minneapolis June 30<sup>th</sup>. Attending will be Commissioners Anderson and Garcia, along with Senator Nancy Todd and Representative Jeni Arndt.

## **F. Annual Election of CCHE Officers**

Commissioner Kaufman nominated Monte Moses for Chairman and Luis Colon for Vice Chairman. Commissioner Anderson seconded the nomination. The Commissioners voted unanimously to elect Monte Moses and Luis Colon to those positions.

## **II. Consent Items**

- A. Degree Authorization Act: Rocky Mountain College of Art and Design – Request for the Renewal of Authorization – Heather DeLange**
- B. Recommend Approval of Master of Arts in Education – Teacher Licensure at Fort Lewis College – Dr. Ian Macgillivray and Dr. Robert Mitchell**
- C. Recommend Approval of Master of Finance at Colorado State University – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- D. Recommend Approval of Nine New Degrees at Metropolitan State University of Denver – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- E. Recommend Authorization to Offer Supplemental Academic Instruction at University of Northern Colorado – Dr. Ian Macgillivray**
- F. Two-Year Cash Funded Capital Program List Amendment – Colorado Mesa University - Catherine Olukotun**

Commissioner Garcia moved to approve consent items A through F. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and unanimously passed.

## **III. Presentations**

Kachina Weaver, Chief Policy Officer, Dr. Beth Bean, Chief Research Officer, and Dr. Tim Flanagan, Chief Student Success and Academic Affairs Officers informed the Commission that the presentations, by Presidents and Vice Presidents of three institutions, would be highlighting programs in their institutions that align with both the four statewide goals of the Master Plan; 1) *Increasing Attainment*; 2) *Improving*

*Student Success; 3) Reducing Gaps; and 4) Restoring Fiscal Balance and the Department's three Strategic Priority Initiatives (SPIs): SPI 1-Close the attainment gap by at least half by 2025; SPI 2-Advance College Affordability; and SPI 3-Engage and Educate Adults.*

- Dr. Mark Potter, Associate Vice President for Undergraduate Students at Metropolitan State University of Denver explained that MSU Denver is the process of becoming designated as a Hispanic Serving Institution, which will help to close the attainment gap.
- Dr. Patty Erjavec, President of Pueblo Community College, explained that her institution serves the southwest corner of the state. This area has very large Hispanic and Native American populations. Pueblo Community College also a very low socioeconomic status institution. Tuition is low but quality academia is provided to the students, along with a commitment to student success.
- Dr. Becky Takeda-Tinker, President of Colorado State University Global Campus, explained that CSU Global is an online campus that enrolls adults in bachelor's degree completion and master's degree programs.

#### **IV. Discussion Items**

**A. Legislative Update** – Kachina Weaver, Chief Policy Officer, noted the General Assembly ended their session on May 11<sup>th</sup> with no substantive work being placed on higher education. Ms. Weaver briefly highlighted legislation that was passed during the session.

#### **V. Action Items**

**A. Recommend Approval of Guaranteed Transfer (GT) Pathways Content Criteria and Competencies** - Dr. Ian Macgillivray, Director of Academic Affairs, presented his action item recommending approval of new competencies and content criteria for the state's GT (guaranteed transfer) Pathways curriculum. These competencies and content criteria set a minimum threshold for what students should know and be able to do after passing a state general education, guaranteed-to-transfer course. This information was presented as a discussion item at the Commission's April 1, 2016 meeting. Since that time, the draft competencies and content criteria have been finalized.

Commissioner Anderson stated that the content criteria and competencies were a work in process. He said that untold faculty time has been spent on these competencies and they are worthy of approval. He also recommended staff be able to tinker with them to make non-substantive changes without coming back to the Commission.

Commissioner Babbs asked what the next steps are if these get approved? Dr. Macgillivray replied that faculty will begin the process of revising syllabi to align with the new competencies and content criteria and resubmit them for peer review and approval by CCHE. This will start with Written Communication and Mathematics courses first, because those are the foundational courses, and then do the other content areas in groups over the next 3 years. There will be exploration into an online platform that could make this review process more manageable.

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the GT Pathways Content Criteria and Competencies. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and unanimously passed.

- B. Prior Learning Assessment: Recommendations for Phase 1, Goal 1 – Challenge Exams** - Dr. Ian Macgillivray informed the Commissioners that this action item contained recommendations from the Constituent Review Team (CRT) for Phase 1, Goal 1 of the Commission’s process for a statewide policy on prior learning assessment as regards to challenge exams. The CRT also recommends extending the timeline and due dates, to late 2016, for College Level Examination Program (CLEP) exams; DANTES Subject Standardized Tests (DSST); and for portfolio assessment, to allow for a thorough review by faculty. The Commission considered these recommendations as a discussion item at its April 1, 2016 meeting.

Commissioner Anderson moved to approve the Prior Learning Assessment recommendations. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Scott and unanimously passed.

- C. Recommend Adoption of Resolution of Endorsement of the Colorado Math Pathways Task Force Recommendations** - Dr. Ian Macgillivray presented this action item recommending approval of the Standing Committee on Student Success and Academic Affairs’ recommendation that the Commission adopt a resolution to endorse the recommendations of the Colorado Math Pathways Task Force. Chairman Moses said that this is a move in a positive direction. For middle and high schools this will be a big shift in thinking about how to prepare for higher education. There needs to be a communication plan and lots of support to help K12 understand math pathways.

Commissioner Anderson moved to adopt the resolution of endorsement. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Kaufman and unanimously passed.

- D. Fiscal Year 2016-17 Financial Aid Allocations** – Andrew Rauch, Lead Financial Analyst, presented the annual item seeking approval of the Fiscal Year 2016-17 Financial Aid Allocations for the State’s various financial aid programs. The programs are: undergraduate need, graduate need, work-study, merit programs, and career and technical education financial aid programs.

Commissioner Garcia asked if institutions were still struggling to spend work-study. Ms. Sobanet responded that those concerns were expressed a few years ago when a large infusion of money came into work-study, and institutions were concerned about building capacity fast enough to spend it. It was a one-time concern. Mr. Rauch said that the Department did not see evidence this past year of institutions being unable to spend their work-study allocations.

Commissioner Garcia also asked if the Department will be looking at the completion incentives grant efficacy. Mr. Rauch replied that work will be done this summer.

Commissioner Scott moved to approve the Financial Aid allocation. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Babbs and unanimously passed.

## **VI. Written Report**

**A. Annual Report on Remedial Education** – Michael Vente, Research and Policy Analyst, presented this year’s Remedial Education report. Mr. Vente outlined several highlights from the report.

- Overall, the percentage of the 2014 high school graduates placed into remediation in at least one subject was 35.4 %, a slight increase from the previous year of 34.2%. Of the 22,853 high school graduates who matriculated to college in Colorado, 7,472 students were not college ready and required at least one remedial course. About 38.6 percent of college female students were not college ready compared to 31.7 percent of college matriculated males.
- At two-year institutions, 82 percent of Black, non-Hispanic students required developmental education. At four-year institutions, 52.5 percent of Black, non-Hispanic students required developmental education. At two-year institutions, almost 70 percent of Hispanic students required developmental education. At four-year institutions, 39 percent of Hispanic students required developmental education. Of Free and Reduced Lunch program participants, 53.4 percent were not college ready compared to 31.4 percent of non-FRL students who were not college ready.
- When examining remediation by subject, most students required remediation in mathematics. For the second year, remedial students had higher first year retention rates than non-remedial students at community colleges. More than 62 percent of all remedial courses were completed successfully, an increase from the previous year. Combined, the estimated cost to the state and estimated tuition cost to the student for remedial courses amount to approximately \$39.3 million in FY2014-15. This is a \$7.8 million dollar savings from last year due to fewer students taking remedial courses and fewer courses being offered.

Commissioner Fagan asked for clarification around the definition for students “assessed” as needing remediation. Mr. Vente explained that the “assessed” term in the report is used to describe students who score below the set cut scores on a variety of tests including the ACT and Accuplacer. DHE receives these data from institutions when students apply.

Commissioner Scott asked if there was a difference between “remedial” and “academically prepared”. Mr. Vente was not aware of any differences between those two terms. He explained that the terms “remedial”, “college ready”, and “developmental education” were used interchangeably throughout the report.

Advisor Cavanaugh and Commissioner Garcia both noted the link between higher retention rates and remediation at community colleges. They both felt more should be done to look into this link. Dr. Artis reminded the Commission that continued attention should be given to the set cut scores given the various initiatives undertaken by the Commission including the implementation of SAI and math pathways. Dr. Bean noted that DHE is working with an outside evaluator on student characteristics and successes with SAI. The report should be available in the fall.

Commissioner Garcia asked what was being done to follow up with those 4-year institutions that aren't offering SAI. Dr. Macgillivray replied that the Department recently found out that all, or most, of those institutions are offering SAI but they haven't notified CDHE or submitted proposals to CCHE. Staff will follow up with them.

Commissioner Fagan asked how the college-ready cut scores in the current Remedial Policy are being revised. Dr. Macgillivray replied that the current policy has one cut score for math, such as an ACT math score of 19, which only indicates readiness for a quantitative reasoning or Math for the Liberal Arts type of math course, not for a math course like Calculus, which would be an ACT math score in the mid to upper 20's. This is where math pathways can help demystify the remedial policy. Rather than one cut score for math, there will be multiple subscores aligned with the math pathway, or math course, required of Arts & Humanities degrees versus Social & Behavioral Science degrees versus STEM, Health Professions and some Business and Economics degrees. There should be a policy that shows the different cut scores and, thus, levels of math preparation required of different career interests/degree paths that will help high school advisors, students and families better understand how to prepare for the math they will need for their chosen degree or certificate.

***There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:30pm***